

PRIVILEGE LOG**Source: MSHA OAS files**

| DATE | AUTHOR | RECIPIENT(S) | DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION | PRIVILEGE ASSERTED |
|-------------|---|---|--|--------------------------------|
| 12/4/2012 | Ernest A. Cameron Director of Administration And Management | Charles J. Thomas Deputy Administrator Coal Mine Safety And Health | Proposed Discipline Memorandum (Pre-Decisional document) | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 12/5/2012 | Ernest A. Cameron Director of Administration And Management | Lincoln L. Selfe, Jr. Supervisory Mine Safety and Health Inspector | Proposed Discipline Memorandum (Pre-Decisional document) | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 12/5/2012 | Ernest A. Cameron Director of Administration And Management | Donald Winston Supervisory Mine Safety and Health Specialist | Proposed Discipline Memorandum (Pre-Decisional document) | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 12/5/2012 | Ernest A. Cameron Director of Administration And Management | Thomas V. Moore, Sr. Supervisory Coal Mine Safety and Health Specialist | Proposed Discipline Memorandum (Pre-Decisional document) | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 12/20/2012 | Lincoln L. Selfe, Jr. Supervisory Mine Safety and Health Inspector | Patricia W. Silvey Deputy Assistant Secretary for Operations Monique Molina Executive Assistant MSHA; Donna Kramer, Supervisory Human Resources Specialist, Office of the Assistant Secretary for Administration and Management | Written response to Proposed Discipline Memorandum (Pre-Decisional document) | Deliberative Process Privilege |

DLB-2255-00001

| | | | | |
|------------|---|---|--|--------------------------------|
| 12/21/2012 | Charles J. Thomas Deputy Administrator Coal Mine Safety And Health | <p>Patricia W. Silvey Deputy Assistant Secretary for Operations</p> <p>Ernest A. Cameron Director of Administration and Management</p> <p>Nancy Crawford Director of Human Resources</p> <p>Kevin G. Stricklin Administrator for Coal Mine Safety and Health</p> | Written response to Proposed Discipline Memorandum (Pre-Decisional document) | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 1/7/2013 | Donald Winston Supervisory Mine Safety and Health Specialist | <p>Patricia W. Silvey Deputy Assistant Secretary for Operations</p> | Written response to Proposed Discipline Memorandum (Pre-Decisional document) | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 1/17/2013 | Lincoln L. Selfe, Jr. Supervisory Mine Safety and Health Inspector | <p>Patricia W. Silvey Deputy Assistant Secretary for Operations</p> <p>cc: Charles E. Carpenter, MSHA; Monique Molina Executive Assistant MSHA; Donna Kramer, Supervisory Human Resources Specialist, Office of the Assistant Secretary for Administration and Management</p> | Email response to Proposed Discipline Memorandum (Pre-Decisional document) | Deliberative Process Privilege |

| | | | | |
|--|---|-----|--|--------------------------------|
| 8/13/2012- 4/3/2013 (various dates) | Patricia W. Silvey Deputy Assistant Secretary for Operations | N/A | Interview notes, notes from meetings, and administrative notes involving proposed discipline (Pre-Decisional document) | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 12/17/2012- 4/3/2013 | Monique Molina Executive Assistant MSHA | N/A | Interview notes and notes from meetings involving proposed discipline (Pre-Decisional document) | Deliberative Process Privilege |

Source: OASAM HR – Donna Kramer files

| DATE | AUTHOR | RECIPIENT(S) | DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION | PRIVILEGE ASSERTED |
|-----------|--|----------------------------|---|--------------------------------|
| 1/24/2013 | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: John Moran | notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Patricia Silvey Deputy Assistant Secretary for Operations MSHA | Kevin G. Stricklin | Draft of the Letter of Warning Memorandum | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A | Pre-memorandum write- up involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Ernest A. Cameron Director Administration and Management | Donald Winston | Draft Memorandum Notice of Proposed Discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 12/20/12 | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Donald Winston | notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |

| | | | | |
|------------|--|---------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Thomas V. Moore | Pre-memorandum write-up involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 4/3/2013 | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Donald Winston | notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Ernest A. Cameron Director Administration and Management | Thomas V. Moore | Draft Memorandum of Proposed Discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 12/20/12 | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Thomas V. Moore | notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Ernest A. Cameron Director Administration and Management | Charles J. Thomas | Draft Memorandum of Proposed Discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 1/10/13 | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Charles Thomas | notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Ernest A. Cameron Director Administration and Management | Lincoln L. Selfe, Jr. | Draft Memorandum of Proposed Discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 12/20/2012 | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Lincoln Selfe | notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 12/28/2012 | Patricia Silvey Deputy Assistant Secretary for Operations | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | Email forwarding response from Lincoln Selfe and other related matters | Deliberative Process Privilege |

| | | | | |
|-----------|--|--|--|--------------------------------|
| 4/3/2013 | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Lincoln Selfe | notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 1/17/2013 | Patricia Silvey Deputy Assistant Secretary for Operations | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | Email forwarding additional response from Lincoln Selfe re: 12/5/2012 Memorandum of Proposed Discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Administrator | Working copy; typed notes – rev. of information to provide opinion & advice to MSHA regarding potential actions | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Deputy Administrator | Working copy; typed notes – rev. of information to provide opinion & advice to MSHA regarding potential actions | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: ADM for Enforcement (ADM) – West Sample Tracking | Working copy; typed notes – rev. of information to provide opinion & advice to MSHA regarding potential actions | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Assistant District Manager for Enforcement (ADM) – Flagrant Violations | Working copy; typed notes – rev. of information to provide opinion & advice to MSHA regarding potential actions | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Field Office Supervisor – Supervisory Coal Mine Safety and | Working copy; typed notes – rev. of information to provide opinion & advice to MSHA regarding | Deliberative Process Privilege |

| | | | | |
|---------|------------------------------|--|--|--------------------------------|
| | | Health Specialist | potential actions | |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Field Office Supervisor – Tailgate Roof Support | Working copy; typed notes – rev. of information to provide opinion & advice to MSHA regarding potential actions | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Field Office Supervisor – Inspection by Trainee | Working copy; typed notes – rev. of information to provide opinion & advice to MSHA regarding potential actions | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Roof Control Supervisor – Pillar Stability Analysis | Working copy; typed notes – rev. of information to provide opinion & advice to MSHA regarding potential actions | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Roof Control Supervisor – Required Checklist | Working copy; typed notes – rev. of information to provide opinion & advice to MSHA regarding potential actions | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Roof Control Supervisor – Supervisory Mine Safety and Health Specialist | Working copy; typed notes – rev. of information to provide opinion & advice to MSHA regarding potential actions | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Inspector – Tailgate Roof Support | Working copy; typed notes – rev. of information to provide opinion & advice to MSHA regarding potential actions | Deliberative Process Privilege |

| | | | | |
|-----------|--|--|--|---|
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A; re: Inspector – Rock Dust Survey of Headgate #22 Section | Working copy; typed notes – rev. of information to provide opinion & advice to MSHA regarding potential actions | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 3/21/2012 | Patricia Silvey Deputy Assistant Secretary for Operations | Re: Question Edward Hugler, ASAM Cc: Sydney T. Rose, OASAM HRC, Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC, James Blair, SOL Rose Audette, SOL Monique V. Molina, MSHA | Email re: review of MSHA IR | Deliberative Process Privilege Attorney-Client Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Working copy notes | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 5/1/2012 | Edward Hugler, ASAM | Sydney T. Rose, OASAM HRC, James Blair, SOL Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC Cc: Edward Hugler, ASAM | Email re: review of MSHA IR | Deliberative Process Privilege Attorney-Client Privilege |
| 3/27/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |

| | | | | |
|-----------|-------------------------------|-----|--|--------------------------------|
| 3/29/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 6/5/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 6/7/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 6/8/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 7/25/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 8/14/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 8/17/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 8/21/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |

| | | | | |
|-----------|-------------------------------|---|--|---|
| 8/22/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 8/23/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 9/5/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 9/7/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 9/11/2012 | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC | N/A | Handwritten notes from meetings and administrative notes involving proposed discipline | Deliberative Process Privilege |
| 9/10/2012 | Edward Hugler, ASAM | Sydney T. Rose, OASAM HRC, Donna L. Kramer, OASAM HRC James Blair, SOL | Email on meeting involving pre- disciplinary decision | Deliberative Process Privilege Attorney-Client Privilege |

| | | | | |
|-----------|------------------------------|--|---|---|
| 8/16/2012 | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | James Blair, SOL Sydney T. Rose, OASAM HRC | Email involving pre- disciplinary decision | Deliberative Process Privilege Attorney-Client Privilege |
| UNKNOWN | Donna L. Kramer OASAM HRC | N/A | Selected pages of MSHA Internal Review Report | Deliberative Process Privilege |